

**RESOLUTION OF THE CITY OF PETALUMA
HISTORIC & CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
APPROVING MAJOR HISTORIC SITE PLAN AND ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
FOR NELSON + STRATFORD RESIDENCE EXPANSION
LOCATED AT 515 B STREET
APN: 008-103-003
FILE NO.: PLSR-2023-0002**

WHEREAS, Architect Scott Landry, on behalf of David Nelson and Marilyn Stratford, requesting a Major Historic Site Plan and Architectural Review (HSPAR) review for alterations to an existing two-story residential building located at 515 B Street within a Mixed Use 2 (MU2) zoning district and the A-Street Historic District and Theater District overlay (“Project”); and

WHEREAS, the Project includes the removal of existing rear additions, rear deck, trellis, and ramp; construction of a new two-story rear extension of ± 578 square feet, reroofing with composite shingles in charcoal color, a new garage accessory structure of 271 square feet, a new deck of 144 square feet, a new trellis ± 10 feet in height, and landscape improvements; and the proposed rear extension would expand two stories by ± 578 square feet and extend the dwelling’s main gable roof, at the existing height of ± 33 feet, to terminate at the rear extent of the dwelling’s existing ground-floor dining room; and this extension also introduces two new dormers, two new skylights, extends its original period moldings, and proposes to match existing exterior materials of wood horizontal siding, wood double-hung windows, decorative fixed windows with diamond panes, doors, trim, and brackets; and two tall, narrow windows with a skylight are proposed on either side of the dwelling to provide an architectural separation between the original dwelling and the new rear extension; and the new detached garage, if accurate, is proposed to match the primary dwelling’s architectural style with a gable roof and horizontal siding, with no alterations proposed for the principal façade (West elevation); and

WHEREAS, the Project, given its location within a designated historic district, is subject to review by the Historic and Cultural Preservation Committee consistent with Section 15.020 of Chapter 15 of the Petaluma Implementing Zoning Ordinance; and

WHEREAS, the A-Street Historic District Preservation Guidelines and Standards, adopted by the Petaluma City Council in 1986 through Ordinance No. 1666 N.C.S. provide guidance for new construction and alterations to ensure that the characteristics which justify designation of the District are maintained; and

WHEREAS, with the exception of the historic building, which will be retained, no other historic era features are onsite; and

WHEREAS, on August 1, 2023, the Historic and Cultural Preservation Committee held a duly noticed public hearing to consider the application, at which time all persons interested had the opportunity to be heard; and,

WHEREAS, on August 1, 2023, the Historic and Cultural Preservation Committee considered a staff report analyzing the application, including the California Environmental Quality Act (“CEQA”) determination included therein; and

WHEREAS, a public notice of the Historic and Cultural Preservation Committee hearing was published in the *Petaluma Argus-Courier* on July 21, 2023, and mailed to residents and occupants within 500 feet of the Project site is in compliance with state and local law.

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT:

- A. The foregoing recitals are true and correct and incorporated herein by reference.
- B. Based on the staff report, staff presentation, comments received, and the public hearing, the Historic and Cultural Preservation Committee makes the following findings based on substantial evidence in the record:

California Environmental Quality Act

- 1. The Project is categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), pursuant to CEQA Section 15301 (Existing Facilities), which includes modifications to existing structures, Section 15331 (Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation), which includes modifications to historic structures that are consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and Section 15303(e) (Accessory appurtenant structures), which includes the construction of small structures such as garages.

Petaluma General Plan

- 2. The Project is consistent with the site's Land Use Map designation Mixed Use 2 (MU2) in that an HSPAR application for exterior alterations to a historic structure was submitted on February 27, 2023, as required, which would result in alterations to an existing two-story residential building on an approximately 3,762 square foot lot.
- 3. The project is, for the reasons contained in the August 1, 2023, Historic and Cultural Preservation Committee staff report, consistent with the following General Plan policies:

Policy 1-P-3 Preserve the overall scale and character of established residential neighborhoods.

Policy 3-P-1 Protect historic and archaeological resources for the aesthetic, cultural, educational, environmental, economic, and scientific contribution they make to maintaining and enhancing Petaluma's character, identity and quality of life.

Historic Demolition Resolution No. 2017-122

- 4. The proposed demolition that would occur to support the rear expansion includes the removal of former rear additions along with the removal of the existing ramp and deck, which is less than 50 percent of the subject property's exterior building walls. Additionally, the project does not alter the height of the building and continues to support its existing maximum height located at the ridge line at approximately 33 feet. For these reasons, the project has not been defined as a demolition consistent with Resolution No. 2017-122.

A-Street Historic District Preservation Guidelines and Standards

5. Architectural

- a. **Style.** The building was originally built in the Craftsman style, which is included as one of A-Street Historic District's prominent and authentic architectural styles. As documented by the HRE, site photographs, and DPR form, all development to date has continued the original dwelling's architectural style. The proposed project does not alter the building's architectural style and does not apply a new landscape design to the site. The addition of new windows on the South, North, and East elevations also do not negatively impact or visually detract from the building's original architectural style. New windows located on the side and rear elevations are similar to existing windows with a single-hung function. Efforts are made for the style and material of the windows to match the dwelling's existing windows. As such, the project is consistent with this guideline.
- b. **Design.** As noted in the previous historical context section, the original dwelling has already experienced alterations with historic additions to the rear and front of the dwelling, as recorded in the Sanborn maps, and these additions have upheld the building's original Craftsman style. This project does not alter the front of the dwelling and does not modify the dwelling's prominent exterior materials, including its horizontal and shingle siding, window styles, or paint colors. As such, the project is consistent with this guideline.

6. Arrangement

- a. **Setback.** The project does not alter or introduce a new setback to the dwelling. The rear expansion proposes continuity of the existing setbacks to the North and South of the property site. The new garage is proposed with no setbacks on its North and East elevation with 1-hour rating exterior walls and abuts the South-East corner of the site. Garages and accessory dwellings located at the rear of a site are typical locations within residential city blocks. As such, the project is consistent with this guideline.
- b. **Side Yards.** The rear expansion of the dwelling does not alter or remove the site's side yards. The North side yard remains intact, and the South side yard continues to be used as a driveway. This driveway would lead toward a new garage at the far South-East corner of the site. The new garage takes up approximately 271 square feet from the back end of the South side yard. The new garage doors would be visible from the public right-of-way (B Street). Within residential areas, including the A-Street Historic District, visibility to a rear garage door is typical. As such, the project is consistent with this guideline.
- c. **Height.** The project does not introduce a new height to the dwelling. The proposed rear extension would expand the two stories of the dwelling by ± 578 square feet and extend the dwelling's main gable roof, at the existing height of approximately 33 feet, to terminate at the rear extent of the dwelling's existing ground-floor dining room. This guideline is intended for primary dwellings and does not assist with the design and development of rear accessory structures, which would benefit from a lower height to adjacent primary dwellings. The new garage as an accessory structure is proposed at a

height of approximately 17 feet. As such, the project is consistent with this guideline.

- d. **Roofline.** The proposed roof expansion continues the existing ridgeline height and eave line and supports a consistent roof design. The two new dormers on the North and South elevation are similar in style and design and do not negatively impact the building's original architectural style or character. As such, the project is consistent with this guideline.
- e. **Façade.** Two tall, narrow windows with a skylight are proposed on either side of the dwelling to provide an architectural separation between the original dwelling and the new rear extension. This architectural strategy reduces the impact of the rear expansion's overall massing on the dwelling within a break in the façade. This window arrangement also provides narrow voids to the solids in the new façade. Two recommendations are provided to develop further the facades on the South and East ground floor:
 - 1. The addition of the ground floor window on the South elevation (refer to Figure 13, window identified as Window A) is independent and does not align with the new dormers above. It is recommended this new window is removed from the design or replaced with a pair of narrow windows on both sides of the South living room wall.
 - 2. Additional narrow and tall windows may be allocated on both sides of the French doors leading onto the new raised deck.

Draft Resolution COA #15 provides for administrative review for the removal or replacement of Window A and for the addition of windows on both sides of the French doors if desired by the property owners. With the proposed design and the recommendations previously noted, the project would be consistent with this guideline.

- 7. **Texture and Materials.** As indicated by the project narrative and architectural drawings, the rear expansion would continue the dwelling's existing materials, including roofing, siding, and trim. The new dormers on the South and North elevations would also continue the use of the sidings and style of windows of the dwelling. As researched and evaluated in the APD Preservation LLC, HRE, the dwelling has been "restored and well maintained, preserving most of its original materials or replacing them in kind as necessary." Aside from the two tall, narrow windows with a skylight, and the selected area with accent siding of black stained V-groove shiplap, no other contemporary features have been introduced to the site. The continuation and selection of features do not alter or impact the dwelling's original Craftsman style and support appropriate proportion and level of detailing. Supporting materials for the project include a rendering and visual sample of the proposed colors and materials (refer to the Colors and Materials Board, Attachment G). As such, the project is consistent with this guideline.
- 8. **Color.** The proposed color scheme is presented within the project's Colors and Materials Board (refer to Attachment G). The project would continue the dwelling's primary colors in the existing siding, trim, and accent colors. Dwellings designed in the Craftsman style supported painted stucco and siding material, along with exposed natural materials such as stone, brick, and wood. The existing and minimal color scheme is appropriate to the

architectural time period of the building in that emphasis was instead placed on the use of architectural materials, and features in the dwelling that includes gable and hip roofs, elevated porches, dormers, and windows. As such, the project is consistent with this guideline

9. **Accessory Fixtures.** The project does not alter original lighting or hardware fixtures. However, the project does remove the existing trellis located at the rear end of the driveway which spans from the raised deck to the South fence. This trellis appears to have been built after the development of the former rear additions as it is braced to the raised deck. Removal of this trellis would not significantly impact the character or integrity of the dwelling. The new trellis would be constructed over the new raised deck at the rear of the dwelling. As such, the project is consistent with this guideline.
10. **Landscape.** As part of the outdoor development, a new trellis, a raised deck, and a 5-foot gate are proposed at the East side of the rear expansion. Additional fencing, walls, and screening are not included in the project description. The proposed site plans include the removal of one tree abutting the North property line and preserving the large tree in the rear lawn. A tree permit and survey pursuant to the IZO is required. No landscape or hardscape work is included in the project description; however, the architectural drawings indicate a patio area abutting the new raised deck and new garage. It also illustrates vegetation on the North-East edge of the site. Draft Resolution COA #16 provides for administrative review of future minor landscape work if desired by the property owners. As such, the project is consistent with this guideline.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties

11. The Project is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties for Rehabilitation, as follows:
 - a. **Standard #1:** The property was historically developed with a dwelling and continues to be located in its original location with a historic district overlay. No changes are proposed to the use of the building as a single-family dwelling. As such, the project is consistent with this standard.
 - b. **Standard #2:** The project does not propose the removal of integral historic architectural features related to the dwelling's "Craftsman" style. The proposed demolition that would occur to support the rear expansion includes the removal of former rear additions along with the removal of the existing ramp and deck, which is less than 50 percent of the subject property's exterior building walls. These rear additions have four different roofs and ridgelines and do not reflect the dwelling's primary front gable roof (refer to Figure 7). As such, the project is consistent with this standard.
 - c. **Standard #3:** The project does not create a false sense of historical development and does not add conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings. The proposed scope provides for rear expansion to optimize the use of the structure on the ground and second floor and preserves the dwelling's Craftsman style. As such, the project is consistent with this guideline.

- d. **Standard #4:** As researched and evaluated in the APD Preservation LLC, HRE, the dwelling has undergone a series of additions to the rear and front of the structure. The Sanborn maps recorded increases in square footage as early as 1906. The work completed to integrate a half-story and a more expansive front are identified as key changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right to be retained and preserved. The dwelling currently exhibits a steep gable supporting the second story (half story) and retains an elaborate front elevation which the scope of this project does not impact nor alter. As such, the project is consistent with this guideline.
- e. **Standard #5:** As previously stated, the project will preserve the dwelling's Craftsman features and continue existing exterior finishes, including the roofing, siding, and trim to the rear expansion. The new garage's exterior surface is proposed with horizontal and shingle siding to match the primary dwelling. The proposed architectural detailing and incorporation of existing materials to the rear expansion and the new garage would maintain consistency with the site's overall architectural style. As such, the project is consistent with this standard.
- f. **Standard #6:** Supporting documents for this project include photographic documentation of existing conditions that do not immediately demonstrate deterioration beyond repair to the original dwelling or the existing rear additions. Removal of the former rear additions does not alter or impact the character of the building and is intended to support interior remodeling, provide continuous spaces on the ground and second floor, and increase its interior areas. Historic architectural features of the dwelling are not removed. As such, the project is consistent with this standard.
- g. **Standard #7:** The project does not propose chemical or physical treatments to the historic building. Draft Resolution COA #13 requires that chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible is taken to avoid damage to the historic materials.
- h. **Standard #8:** Some excavation is to occur as part of the rear expansion, new deck, and new garage. However, these areas on the site have already experienced disturbance during the dwelling's various additions. Work of undisturbed ground is not a part of this project, and a condition is included as a preventative measure to protect and preserve significant archeological resources if potentially significant prehistoric or historic archeological resources are encountered during the course of ground-disturbing activities (refer to Draft Resolution COA#14). As such, the project is consistent with this standard.
- i. **Standard #9:** The project proposes the removal of existing rear additions, rear deck, trellis, and ramp and includes a new two-story rear extension of approximately 578 square feet, reroofing with composite shingles in charcoal color, a new garage accessory structure of 271 square feet, a new deck of 144 square feet, a new trellis approximately 10 feet in height, and landscape improvements. The proposed rear extension would expand the two stories of the dwelling by \pm 578 square feet and extend the dwelling's main gable roof, at the existing height of approximately 33 feet, to

terminate at the rear extent of the dwelling's existing ground-floor dining room.

This extension also introduces two new dormers, two new skylights, extends its original period moldings, and proposes to match existing exterior materials of wood horizontal siding, wood double-hung windows, decorative fixed windows with diamond panes, doors, trim, and brackets. Two tall, narrow windows with a skylight are proposed on either side of the dwelling to provide an architectural separation between the original dwelling and the new rear extension. The new detached garage, if accurate, is proposed to match the primary dwelling's architectural style with a gable roof and horizontal siding.

The removal of the former rear additions does not negatively impact the integrity of the dwelling. New dormers and windows are designed and placed to reflect the original design and is cohesive with the Craftsman style. Standard #9 calls for new work to be differentiated from the old. This design establishes an architectural separation between the original dwelling and the rear expansion with the placement of two tall, narrow windows with a skylight on either side of the dwelling (refer to Figure 13). The rear expansion also supports a seamless connection with the original dwelling by continuing the existing ridgeline at approximately 33 feet in height. Therefore, continuing the existing ridgeline for the roof expansion strengthens the dwelling's ridgeline, while the two narrow windows and skylights support a separation between the old and the new. Having multiple breaks in the ridgeline may detract from the building's original exterior architectural features and may reduce its interior spaces' efficient uses.

Most importantly, the new work is compatible in massing, size, and scale as it maintains the building's existing maximum height at approximately 33 feet and matches existing materials. As such, the project is consistent with this standard.

- j. **Standard #10:** The project takes into consideration an efficient design to maximize the use and the potential of a continuous two-story residential building. The roof expansion continues the existing ridgeline of the primary dwelling, approximately 33 feet in height, while the new garage design supports a similar gable roof design, approximately 17 feet in height. Both the rear expansion and the new garage can be removed in the future without impairing the building's essential form and integrity. As such, the project is substantially consistent with this standard.

Implementing Zoning Ordinance

- 12. The Project is consistent with the site's Land Use Map designation Mixed Use 2 (MU2) in that a Major HSPAR application for exterior alterations to a historic structure was submitted on February 27, 2023, as required, would result in alterations to an existing two-story residential building on an approximately 3,762 square foot lot. The proposed project is subject to the objective development standards contained in Table 4.3 of the IZO. The property continues to be consistent with development standards including setbacks, height, and lot coverage with conditions noted in Draft Resolution (Exhibit A).
- 13. The project is consistent with Chapter 15 (Preservation of the Cultural and Historic Environment), in that it has been reviewed by the HCPC in accordance with the

requirements contained in Section 15.070 of the IZO, and it has been determined that the proposed alterations will not adversely affect the character, or the historical, architectural, or aesthetic interest or value of the district.

14. The Project is consistent with the Major Historic Site Plan and Architectural Review standards stated in IZO Section 24.050, as follows:

- a. The project proposes alterations to an existing Craftsman two-story residential building which is one of the inventoried styles listed in the A-Street Historic District. As such, the architectural style is compatible with the overall character of the neighborhood and finds that the project satisfies IZO Section 24.050(E)(1)(a).
- b. The project does not alter the siting of the building on the property and therefore continues to be appropriate for the site and other buildings in the neighborhood. As such, the sitting of the structure on the property is not altered and finds that the project satisfies IZO 24.050(E)(1)(b).
- c. Since the building continues to be of residential use, there are no proposed signage or outdoor advertising structures proposed for the site. As such, finds that the project satisfies IZO 24.050(E)(1)(c).
- d. The project includes a roof extension on the second floor and continues the existing ridgeline and supports a bulk, height, and color appropriate for the site and compared to other structures in the neighborhood. As such, finds that the project satisfies IZO 24.050(E)(1)(d).

D. Based on its review of the entire record herein, including the August 1, 2023, Historic and Cultural Preservation Committee staff report, all supporting, referenced, and incorporated documents, and all comments received, the Historic and Cultural Preservation Committee hereby approves Historic Site Plan and Architectural Review for the Project, subject to the conditions of approval attached hereto as **Exhibit 1**.

EXHIBIT 1

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

Nelson + Stratford Residence

515 B Street

APN: 008-103-003

File No.: PLSR-2023-0002

Standard Conditions of Approval

Planning Division

1. The plans submitted for building permit review shall be in substantial conformance with plans on file with the Planning Division and dated August 22, 2022, except as may be modified by the following conditions. A determination of substantial conformance shall be made by the Planning Manager in writing during the plan check review process. Nothing shall preclude the Planning Manager from referring a substantial conformance determination to the Historic and Cultural Preservation Committee for review at a publicly noticed meeting.
2. The colors and materials shall be in substantial conformance with those noted on the plan set except as modified by these conditions of approval.
3. The day following approval, the applicant shall provide a check made payable to the Sonoma County Clerk in the amount required and published by the Sonoma County Clerk to file the CEQA Notice of Exemption ("NOE").
4. Prior to the issuance of any construction permits, these conditions of approval shall be included with the plan set. A copy of the approved plans shall be maintained on-site when construction activities are occurring.
5. This approval is granted for and contingent upon the construction of the project as a whole, in a single phase, with the construction and/or installation of all features approved and required herein. Modifications to the project, including but not limited to a major change in construction phasing, may require an amendment to this condition by the Historic and Cultural Preservation Committee through the Site Plan and Architectural Review provided at IZO Section 24.050.
6. Consistent with IZO Section 24.050(I), this approval is effective for a twelve (12) month period unless the permit has been exercised or unless an extension of time is approved in compliance with IZO Section 24.050(J).
7. Prior to building permit issuance, all development impact fees shall be paid in full prior to final inspection or issuance of a certificate of occupancy. The applicant/developer has 90 days from the date of this approval to protest the imposition of fees pursuant to Government Code Section 66020. A protest of the imposition of fees shall be considered by the City Council at a public hearing within 90 days after its filing, and the decision of the City Council shall be final.

8. The site shall be kept cleared at all times of garbage and debris. No outdoor storage shall be permitted other than typical bulk materials, i.e., lumber, appliances, window systems, etc., temporarily stored through the normal course of construction.
9. Construction activities shall comply with performance standards specified in IZO Chapter 21 (Performance Standards), except that the permitted construction hours shall be as follows:
 - a. Monday through Friday: 8 a.m. to 6 p.m.
 - b. Saturday: 9:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m.
 - c. Prohibited on Sundays and all holidays recognized by the City of Petaluma.
10. Construction activities shall comply with the following measures, and all shall be noted on construction documents:
 - a. Construction Hours/Scheduling: As noted above.
 - b. Construction Equipment Mufflers and Maintenance: All construction equipment powered by internal combustion engines shall be properly muffled and maintained.
 - c. Idling Prohibitions: All equipment and vehicles shall be turned off when not in use. Unnecessary idling of internal combustion engines is prohibited.
 - d. Equipment Location and Shielding: All stationary noise-generating construction equipment, such as air compressors, shall be located as far as practical from the adjacent homes. Acoustically shield such equipment when it must be located near adjacent residences.
 - e. Quiet Equipment Selection: Select quiet construction equipment, particularly air compressors, whenever possible. Motorized equipment shall be outfitted with proper mufflers in good working order.
 - f. Staging and Equipment Storage: The equipment storage location shall be sited as far as possible from nearby sensitive receptors.
 - g. Generators: No generators shall be utilized during nighttime hours (i.e., sunrise to sunset) to power equipment (e.g., security surveillance) when normal construction activities have ceased for the day. All such equipment should be powered through temporary electrical service lines.
11. Prior to commencing construction activities, a sign shall be posted on the site regarding the allowable hours of construction and contact information for complaints. Proof of sign installation shall be provided to the Planning Manager prior to construction commencing.
12. The applicant shall defend, indemnify, and hold harmless the City or any of its boards, commissions, agents, officers, and employees from any claim, action, or proceeding against the City, its boards, commissions, agents, officers, or employees to attack, set aside, void, or annul any of the approvals of the project when such claim or action is brought within the time period provided for in applicable State and/or local statutes. The City shall promptly notify the applicants/developers of any such claim, action, or proceeding. The City shall coordinate in the defense. Nothing contained in this condition shall prohibit the City from participating in a defense of any claim, action, or proceeding and if the City

chooses to do so appellant shall reimburse City for attorneys' fees by the City.

Project-Specific Conditions of Approval

Planning Division

13. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible is taken to avoid damage to the historic materials.
14. The project is required to comply with measures to protect and preserve significant archeological resources if potentially significant prehistoric or historic archeological resources are encountered during the course of ground-disturbing activities.
15. As discussed in the staff report, (1) in lieu of proposed Window A, located on the South elevation, removal or replacement with a pair of narrow windows on either side of the South living room wall is allowed, subject to administrative review and approval, and (2) the addition of narrow and tall sidelight windows on both sides of the French doors leading onto the new raised deck is allowed, subject to administrative review and approval.
16. Site modifications in the form of minor landscape improvements are allowed, subject to administrative review and approval.

Building Division

17. Proposed project will require building permit application and construction plan approval in compliance with the 2022 California Building Standards Code in CCR Title 24 as adopted by the City of Petaluma. The Building Division reviews applications and plans in accordance with these and the City municipal code. The applicant will need to demonstrate compliance with the construction documents.
18. Full plan submittal is required as applicable to project scope. Architectural, civil, structural, mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems are to be prepared by state-licensed design professionals. See City file preparations standards: Electronic File Preparation Standards - Petaluma (cityofpetaluma.org).
19. Building permit construction documents are to signed by the licensed professional responsible for their preparation and include occupancy classifications, design occupant load, general building area and height limitations, type of construction, and fire sprinkler provisions data for each building on the subject parcel.
20. For the 2022 Building Standards Code cycle the City of Petaluma has adopted CalGreen at the Tier 1 level, with the exception Energy Efficiency, which is adopted at the mandatory level only.
21. Existing structure is non-conforming to modern building codes. Fire separation distance from lot line to existing exterior walls and roof projections with less than 5 feet to property line require 1-hr. fire resistive construction. Walls less than 3 feet are not permitted to have window and door openings. No increase in this non-conformity is allowed. Any increase in the life safety provisions of the code is prudent.

Public Works (Landscaping and Utilities)

22. If applicable, any project with a landscape area of 500 square feet or greater shall submit to the City a complete landscape and irrigation documentation package consisting of all the required elements found in the Landscape Water Use Efficiency Standards located in the Petaluma Municipal Code (PMC) Section 15.17.050.
23. If fire sprinklers are needed. New water services shall be 1.5-inches in diameter with a one-inch meter and double check backflow.